



**NDA**

National  
Development  
Agency



## **CATHOLIC COMMUNITY SERVICES**

### **Close-Out Evaluation Report**

**SEPTEMBER 2013**



CLOSE OUT EVALUATION  
REPORT

OF

CATHOLIC COMMUNITY  
SERVICES 3 (CCS)

Prepared by

THUTO PELE CHARTERED  
ACCOUNTANTS

## **Table of contents**

1. Introduction
2. Scope of the report and nature of the evaluation report
  - 2.1 Scope
  - 2.2 Sources of Information
  - 2.3 Methodology
  - 2.4 Rating
3. About the project
  - 3.1 Background
  - 3.2 Governance structure
  - 3.3 Lawsuit and dispute
  - 3.4 Project description
  - 3.5 Objectives
  - 3.6 SWOT analysis
  - 3.7 Project employment created
  - 3.8 Project impact on the participant and community
  - 3.9 Sustainability
    - Project relevance, effectiveness and efficiency
4. Financial Operations
  - 4.1 Available financial management capacity and skills
  - 4.2 Financial statements
  - 4.3 Project Post funding
5. Compliance and controls
  - 5.1 Sars
  - 5.2 Accounting system
  - 5.3 Internal Controls
  - 5.4 Reporting
6. Professional Observation
  - 6.1 Project successes or failures
  - 6.2 Controls that can be implemented
  - 6.3 Areas that need strategic intervention
7. Conclusion

## **1. Introduction**

We have been appointed to conduct close out evaluation for Catholic Community Services (referred to as CCS) on behalf of National Development Agency (NDA) for the purpose of funding granted to the Project as requested by NDA.

NDA has signed a Service Level Agreement (SLA) with Catholic Community Services. Our responsibility was to carry out close out evaluation. This report is prepared to assist NDA to take the decision on whether to continue assisting the project or not as well as to check if the project's objectives or goals have been achieved or not.

NDA funded Catholic Community Services to the tune of **R796,940.00** for farming project which will turn contribution towards sustainable livelihood of the community. All funds requested were paid in tranches to the project.

## **2. Scope of the report and nature of the Close Out Evaluation**

### **2.1 Scope**

For the purposes of the funding granted to Catholic Community Services by National Development Agency (NDA), we, Thuto Pele CA, have been requested to carry out a Close out Evaluation.

Our work is limited to the scope of work agreed, it does not constitute an audit in terms of International Standards on Auditing (ISA's) and consequently we are not in a position to give an audit opinion on our findings.

The scope covers an assessment of the following:

- Project performance
- Project impact on the participants and community
- Project sustainability
- Project's relevance, effectiveness and efficiency
- Main achievements and challenges.

### **2.2 Sources of information**

Our evaluation process included holding discussions with board members of Catholic Community Services and as well as a review of the information made available to us by such personnel.

### **2.3 Approach methodology**

Our procedures included, but were not limited to, the following procedures:

- Review of application form.
- Review of service level agreement entered between CCS and NDA.
- Review of interim financial statements.
- Review of Catholic Community Service's track record and their ability to meet their objectives.
- Review of awards received.
- Review of organization's registration documents and legal requirements.
- Review of organization's constitution documents.

- Review of Catholic Community Services corporate governance structure and processes.

## 2.4 Rating

The following ratings were used throughout the process:

Met target	(Scale:3)	Address all relevant criteria in full and no deficiencies should be identified
Average	(Scale: 2)	Address most of the relevant criteria and the deficiencies identified should be immaterial in nature.
Poor	(Scale: 1)	Address only some of the relevant criteria and the deficiencies identified should be material in nature

**Discussions with the following officials were held at the project site on the 14<sup>th</sup> August 2013 at CCS Centre (Bethlehem):**

Name
Rodrigues Christopher
FalalaMokoena
LebetaBoikokobetso
LeburuPuseletso
Hanong Kenneth
Aldworth Brian
MosikiliTsoanelo
Hubatan Van Lindener

## 3. About the project

### 3.1 Background of the project

Catholic community Service (CCS) was established in 1997 by Catholic Church under the leadership of Bishop Hubert Bucher as a response to the need to develop community based project of eradicating hardship and suffering cause by poverty. The service is in place for the entire needy community member regardless of their affiliation or denomination.

CCS is incorporated under the Non Profit Organisations ACT (Reg Number: 006-940-NPO) and certified as a Public Benefit Organisation (PBO Reg: 930001771) by SARS. It is based in Bethlehem in the Thabo Mofutsanyane Municipal District located in the eastern part of the Free State Province.

Their main focus is to improve the life of unemployed women, men and youth who have an interest in establishing home vegetable gardens or poultry by giving them necessary support, advices and start up tools.

They have three main Programmes, namely:

- Thuthukani Programme
- Impilo Programme
- M.A.R.U Programme

### **3.2 Governance structure**

Name of the organisation:	Catholic Community Service
Project Number:	0101416
Sector:	Food Security
Organisation Type:	Faith Based Organisation
Target Group:	Unemployed Community Members

Following are Catholic community Service banking details

- Bank name: Ned Bank
- Account holder: Catholic Community Service-3
- Account type: Business Cheque Account
- Account number: 1101095628

### **3.3 Lawsuits and disputes**

Members of the project has confirmed to us that there is no law suit or dispute instituted against the project.

### **3.4 Project description**

The agreement between CCS and NDA to fund MARU project came into effect on 28<sup>th</sup> March 2008 and a total grant to the value of R796,940.00 was granted to implement 20 homestead vegetable gardens in Tshiambe Village (Kholokoe) in order to provide fresh vegetable throughout the year. The trenching was paid as aforementioned guided by the contract. The project started with the activities in October 2011 by recruiting and selecting beneficiaries. The first orientation and signing of the contract between beneficiaries and catholic community service took place from the 2<sup>nd</sup> of November 2011.

The focus was to train unemployed and interested individuals of kholokoe village in basic vegetables gardening, business skill, financial management and project management, ensuring that they are viable and sustainable. CCS has also promise to provide project with necessary equipment and tools, as well as stocks needed to carry out the projects. ABET training and assessors course for target beneficiaries also formed part of the project implementation plan.

### **3.5 Objectives of the project**

- To train 40 beneficiaries on basic vegetable production and assisted to set up their own home vegetable garden.
- To provide 40 beneficiaries with garden equipment and production inputs (seeds and organic pesticide) for vegetables production from month three.
- To provide 40 beneficiaries with after care, extension and monitoring for twenty four months

- To encourage forty beneficiaries to sell surplus vegetables and save extra money for seed levy from month 6
- To train 20 on organisational development and assist them to register as an independent organisation by month 22

### Project's performance measurement against predetermined objectives

Activities	Rating	Comments
1. Consulting with the Tribal Authority for buy in and support	Met target	Approval letter attached
2. Recruitment and selection of forty beneficiaries	Below target	Beneficiaries were selected by Tribal Officers with the help from CCS Officials
3. Orientation and signing of the contract	Met target	The Contract binds the beneficiaries to work towards the projects activities.
4. Training on Vegetable Productions	Met target	Majority of beneficiaries are practically applying their training knowledge. They are more practical
5. Provision of garden Equipment	Met target	All beneficiaries have provided with the necessary equipment's
6. Land preparation and establishment of vegetables beds.	Met target	Majority of their land have been prepared for production
7. Advance training	Met target	All beneficiaries that shows commitment were given opportunity to advance training on business management and marketing. One beneficiary won vegetable production competition.
8. Good Governance training	Below target	Literacy level of some beneficiaries is very low and this affect their compliance.

### 3.6 SWOT analysis

<p><b>Strengths</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Committed and experience board members</li> <li>- Beneficiaries were trained for production or crop farming</li> <li>- Availability of land for farming</li> <li>- Availability of resources (water tank, garden tools, etc.)</li> </ul>	<p><b>Weaknesses</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Lack of water supply</li> <li>- Poor marketing activities within the project results in beneficiaries not selling enough to generate income</li> </ul>
<p><b>Opportunities</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Support from government department (local municipality supply water to the households)</li> <li>- Opportunity to produce sell (already have customers on board)</li> </ul>	<p><b>Threats</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Legislation and by laws</li> <li>- Competitors reactions</li> </ul>

### 3.7 Project employment opportunities created/secured

The project has not created any formal employment except that majority of beneficiaries are economically benefiting from the project. The produce products for self consumption at their homes. Only one household is selling the surplus to community.

### 3.8 Project impact on the participants and community

Six households benefit from the project as they produce products for self consumption and some community members buy from the gardens as well.

### 3.9 Sustainability.

The project can be sustainable if member receive thorough training on marketing and all other problems such water can be resolved. The project is still depending on NDA funding only and beneficiary is doing everything in their power to maximise production.

### 3.10 Project's relevance, effectiveness and efficiency

The project is relevant to its member because majority of them believe that it can still achieve beyond current results. And it also attracted lot of attention from the community of kholokoe and surrounding areas.

## 4. Financial operations

### 4.1 Available financial management capacity and skill

The financials of the project is overseen by appointed Bookkeeper who is well trained about financial management.

- Bookkeeper does prepares management accounts report for the project.
- The filing of supporting documentations is appropriate.



## 4.2 Financial statements

The financial statements of Catholic Community Services for the period ended 31 December 2012 were submitted to us for our review and there were not audited because a preparer and Audit report was issued by accounting officer not Auditor.

### Statement of comprehensive income

The income statement review is based on the Interim Financial Statements for the six months period ended 31 December 2012.

<b>Statement of comprehensive income for the six months period ended 31 December 2012</b>	
	<b>2012</b>
	<b>R</b>
Income	1,727,686.00
Operating expenses	1,667,184.00
<b>Operating surplus for the year</b>	<b>60,503.00</b>
Other interest received	8,653.00
<b>Total comprehensive income for the year</b>	<b>69,156.00</b>

### Statement of financial position

The Statement of financial position is based on the interim financial statements as at 31 December 2012.

	<b>31 December 2012</b>
	<b>R</b>
<b>ASSETS</b>	
<b>Non - Current Assets</b>	
Property, plant and equipment	292,488.00
<b>Current Assets</b>	
Cash and cash equivalents	1,034,460.00
<b>Total Assets</b>	<b>1,326,948.00</b>
<b>EQUITY AND LIABILITIES</b>	
Accumulated Funds	1,326,948.00
<b>Total Equity and Liabilities</b>	<b>1,326,948.00</b>

Note: During our evaluation process we noted that the above financial statements were prepared by a registered Accounting Officer, but the report was issued as Audit Report with an audit opinion.

## 4.3 Post funding project

The project is still operating through NDA funding. If identified challenges can be addressed the project can be able to sustainable and grow to produce and sell more products to the community and that will contribute towards the local economic development of the area.

## **5. Compliance and Controls**

### **5.1 Income tax**

During our evaluation process we verified that CCS is registered with SARS and have a valid tax clearance as proof and the newly registered co-operative (Ukuthulanoxolo) is still on the registration process.

### **5.2 Accounting system**

The project is using Pastel Partner 2009 for keeping accounting record and are processed in house.

### **5.3 Internal control**

Board members of Catholic Community Services oversee governance and control of the projects activities. The project so far runs smoothly and in accordance with its objectives per the business plan and organisation's constitution.

### **5.4 Reporting**

Progress reports were sent to NDA offices in Bloemfontein explaining all the success and challenges encountered by the project. NDA Provincial Development Manager (DM) visited the project site for monitoring.

## **6. Professional Observation**

### **6.1 The project's success or failure**

- Recycled water for irrigation system
- 40 beneficiaries on BVP training

They have managed to train 37 were enrolled and 3 of the never enrolled. 5 out of 37 never stated their vegetable garden. One out of the remaining 34 stopped and the other one died. 32 beneficiaries are active. (80%)

- 40 beneficiaries to get start-up equipment's  
37 trained individual received spade, fork, rake, wheelbarrow, small weeding tools, watering can, two pieces overall and assorted seeds.(93%)  
32 Trainees that showed commitment have received water tank.

- Home state operate their own garden
- Recycle water for irrigation
- Monitoring

Partly archived and on-going. They have managed to negotiate 4000sqm of land and fenced it for registered Cooperatives (Ukuthulanoxolo).

- To sell Surplus vegetable and save extra money.

Only 3 were able to sell and 29 households depend mainly on the garden.

- To train 20 on organisational development

14 individual was trained in Good governance and 36 on advance training  
They have managed to help 5 trained individuals to group themselves and register as Cooperatives (Ukuthulanoxolo).

## **6.2 Controls that can be put in place to deal with challenges in the project**

- Test availability of underground water for drilling. If not enough arrangement should be made with local municipality to deliver more water to the project or use the nearest dam for supply of water.
- Young people should be recruited to assist the old ones especially from the admin division.
- Beneficiaries should produce more in order to sell to the community in order to generate income.
- The project has a potential to grow and sustain itself should more efforts be attempted on water supply

## **6.3 Areas that need strategic intervention**

- Supply of water
- Level of literacy amongst members
- Fencing of household gardens
- Recycled water needs to be tested for quality

## **7. Conclusion**

The following areas were noted from evaluations:

- Limited number of site visits was done for the project.
- Beneficiaries has enough land for production.
- Beneficiaries were trained for production
- The bookkeeper is well experienced and trained.
- Majority of household produces for self consumption. Need to encourage them to sell surplus to community



# NDA

National  
Development  
Agency

## LIMPOPO

Albatross Centre - Suite 8  
19 Market Street  
Polokwane  
0700

Tel: 015 291 2492  
Reception Ext (2201)  
Fax: 015 295 7586  
Email: limpopoprovince@nda.org.za

## KWAZULU NATAL

Suite 1202  
Nedbank Centre  
303 Smith Street  
Durban Club Place  
DURBAN  
4001

Tel: 031 305 5542  
Fax: 031 305 5140  
Email: kznprovince@nda.org.za

## GAUTENG

10<sup>th</sup> Floor, Braamfontein Centre  
23 Jorissen Street  
Braamfontein

Tel: 011 339 6410  
Fax: 011 339 6410  
Email: gautengprovince@nda.org.za

## EASTERN CAPE

The Ridge Building  
Ground Floor,  
3 Berea Terrace  
Berea  
East London  
5214

Tel: 043 721 1226/7  
Fax: 043 721 2096  
Email: ecprovince@nda.org.za

## NORTH WEST

Office 0113A  
First Floor  
West Gallery Megacity  
Mmabatho  
2735

PO Box 6118  
Mmabatho  
2735

Tel: 018 392 6892  
Fax: 018 392 5432  
Email: northwesternprovince@nda.org.za

## WESTERN CAPE

The Chambers Building  
2<sup>nd</sup> Floor  
50 Keerom Street  
Cape Town  
8001

Tel: 021 422 5175  
Fax: 021 422 5180 EXT: 2002  
Email: westerncapeprovince@nda.org.za

## FREE STATE

Quantum Building  
Office No 209 - 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor  
172 Zastron Street  
Bloemfontein  
9300

Postnet Suite 131  
Private Bag X 01  
Brandhof  
9324

Tel: 051 430 2024  
Fax: 051 430 3376  
Email: freestateprovince@nda.org.za

## MPUMALANGA

Ground floor  
Biwater Building Office 103  
16 Branders Street  
Nelspruit  
1200

Tel: 013 755 1478 / 013 755 3777  
Fax: 013 753 2244  
Email:  
mpumalangaprovince@nda.org.za

## NORTHERN CAPE

13 Dalham Road  
Kimberley  
8301

PO BOX 390  
Kimberley  
8300

Tel: 053 831 4828/9  
053 831 4831  
053 832 3365  
Fax: 053 831 4824  
Email: northerncapeprovince@nda.org.za



**NDA**

National  
Development  
Agency

## **NATIONAL HEAD OFFICE**

2<sup>nd</sup> Floor – Grosvenor Corner  
195 Jan Smuts & 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue  
Parktown North  
Johannesburg  
2193

P.O. Box 31959  
Braamfontein  
2017

Tel: (011) 018 5500  
Web: [www.nda.org.za](http://www.nda.org.za)  
Email: [info@nda.org.za](mailto:info@nda.org.za)



**social development**

Department  
Social Development  
REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA



**sassa**

SOUTH AFRICAN SOCIAL SECURITY AGENCY



**NDA**

National  
Development  
Agency